



Implementation of the policy of equalizing supervisory positions into functional positions at borneo University Tarakan

Dewi Mirayanthi

Ilmu Administrasi Bidang Administrasi Publik, Fakultas Hukum, Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik, Universitas Terbuka

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received Jun 07 2024

Revised Jun 22, 2024

Accepted Jul 04, 2024

Keywords:

Functional Position;
Equalization of Position;
Public Service;
Bureaucratic Reformation.

ABSTRACT

This study aims to evaluate the implementation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Regulation Number 28 of 2019 concerning Equalization of Administrative Positions into Functional Positions at the University of Borneo Tarakan (UBT). The research method used is qualitative, with data collection through interviews, observation, and documentation. The results showed that policy implementation at UBT was not optimal. There are major obstacles in terms of communication, where information regarding equalization of positions is conveyed through private networks without adequate socialization. In addition, there are resource constraints, such as the incompatibility of the educational background of civil servants with the functional positions held and the limitations of supporting facilities. The bureaucratic structure that has not adjusted the Organization and Work Procedures (OTK) and Standard Operational Procedure (SOP) is also an obstacle. In addition, there are obstacles outside the indicator, namely the collection of credit numbers. In conclusion, to overcome these obstacles, it is recommended that UBT hold a more comprehensive socialization, conduct a more detailed position mapping, improve supporting facilities, and immediately propose changes to the OTK and SOP to the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology. The implementation of this position equalization requires more supportive regulations and credit score assessment submitted to UBT.

This is an open access article under the [CC BY-NC](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/) license.



Corresponding Author:

Dewi Mirayanthi,

Fakultas Hukum, Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik,

Universitas Terbuka,

Jl. Pd. Cabe Raya, Pd. Cabe Udik, Kec. Ciputat, Kota, Tangerang Selatan, Banten 15437, Indonesia.

Email: dewimira8181@gmail.com

1. INTRODUCTION

Universitas Borneo Tarakan (UBT) is a state university located in Tarakan City, North Kalimantan Province, the youngest province in Indonesia. Established by Pinekindi Foundation on October 9, 1999, UBT was officially established based on Pinekindi Foundation Decree Number: 011/YP/TRK/III/2000 on March 30, 2000. UBT's status was then changed to a State University through Presidential Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 65 of 2010 on November 19, 2010. As a government institution, UBT

has an obligation to organize public services that are transparent, accountable, efficient, effective, and responsive.

However, reality shows that public service delivery in Indonesia, including at UBT, still faces various weaknesses that result in unprofessionalism and lack of effectiveness in handling public affairs. To overcome this problem, the government has made various efforts, one of which is by carrying out public administration reform (Dwyer et al., 2020; Idris, 2021). This reform is expected to improve the quality of public services through various steps, such as simplifying regulations and restructuring the bureaucracy (Maulana et al., 2022).

The establishment and transformation of this university reflects broader efforts in Indonesia to reform the bureaucratic system, with the aim of improving the provision of public services in various sectors, including education. UBT's recent development demonstrates the challenges prevalent in bureaucratic reform, such as the optimization of administrative processes, increased transparency, and the adjustment of organizational structures to meet modern governance standards. Public service delivery at Universitas Borneo Tarakan (UBT) exhibits significant weaknesses that underscore the pressing need for administrative reform. These weaknesses include inefficiencies in processes leading to delays and suboptimal outcomes, transparency and accountability deficits in decision-making processes, and inadequacies in responsiveness to stakeholder needs such as students, faculty, and the local community. These shortcomings emphasize the critical importance of administrative reforms aimed at enhancing operational efficiency, transparency, accountability, and stakeholder responsiveness within UBT.

Barriers such as lack of leadership commitment, weak organizational culture, and limited resources pose considerable challenges to the implementation of reforms at UBT. The absence of robust leadership commitment may result in inconsistent prioritization and inadequate resource allocation, undermining the effectiveness of reform initiatives. A weak organizational culture resistant to change or lacking clear values and norms supportive of reform further complicates adoption and sustainability of new practices and policies. Additionally, limited financial and human resources constrain efforts to implement reforms effectively, including investments in training, technology, and infrastructure upgrades. Addressing these barriers requires proactive measures to foster strong leadership engagement, cultivate a supportive organizational culture conducive to change, and secure sufficient resources to sustain reform efforts effectively at UBT.

Research by Setyasih (2023) shows that the implementation of bureaucratic reform in Indonesia still faces various challenges, such as lack of leadership commitment, weak organizational culture, and limited resources. Factors that support the successful implementation of bureaucratic reform are strong leadership, a supportive organizational culture, and the availability of adequate resources (Rizqi, 2021; Rifa'i & Albetris, 2022; Setiawan et al. (2022); Sri (2022); Widiyastomo (2020). The implementation of PermenPANRB No. 28/2019 in several government agencies is still constrained by less than optimal socialization, a complicated process of appointing functional positions, and not optimal performance assessment and competency development of ASN (Malik & Wahid, 2023).

This public administration reform is crucial in creating services that are more professional and responsive to political, social, and economic changes in Indonesia Khuroshvili (2023); Petrescu & Mihalache (2020); Greve et al. (2020). The ultimate goal is to achieve good governance, which requires bureaucrats' expertise and competence in implementing policies Shafritz et al. (2022). One of the concrete steps in this reform is the elimination of Echelon or Structural Positions in various government institutions, including at UBT, as a form of bureaucratic simplification that is expected to improve performance and public services.

The study of the implementation of the equalization of Supervisory Positions into Functional Positions at UBT has importance for several reasons. First, this conversion aims to simplify administrative roles, potentially increasing efficiency and reducing overlap in UBT's organizational structure. Second, evaluation of this reform can measure its impact on improving the quality of educational services provided by UBT to its students and stakeholders. Third, an understanding of the challenges and successes in this implementation provides deep insight into broader efforts to modernize bureaucratic and governance practices in Indonesian public universities. Finally, the findings from this study can assist in policy decision-making for administrative reforms in higher education institutions in Indonesia, contributing to ongoing efforts for effective and responsive public administration.

In 2019, through the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Regulation Number 28, the equalization of Administrative Positions into Functional Positions was carried out. This policy aims to create a more professional and dynamic bureaucracy, and improve effective and efficient public services. The implementation of this policy at UBT faces various challenges and obstacles, including in terms of communication, resources, and bureaucratic structure (Bothale, 2023; SYAPUTRA, 2021; Bangsawan, 2020).

Therefore, this research will discuss the implementation of the equalization of Supervisory Position into Functional Position at the University of Borneo Tarakan. The focus of this research is to identify the obstacles faced in the equalization process, as well as to evaluate the effectiveness of the policy in order to improve institutional performance and the quality of public services. This research will also provide recommendations that can be used by UBT and the government in an effort to improve the quality of public services through more optimal administrative reform.

2. RESEARCH METHOD

This research uses qualitative methods to gain an in-depth understanding of the topic under study. Qualitative methods produce descriptive data in the form of written or spoken words from people and observable behavior (Bogdan and Taylor in Moleong, 2014: 3). The participants in this study were civil servants of Supervisory Officers and Personnel Analysts at the University of Borneo Tarakan. Data were collected through interviews with respondents, namely Supervisory Officers who are equalized to Functional Positions, and informants, namely Personnel Analysts.

Participants in this study, comprising Supervisory Officers and Personnel Analysts at Universitas Borneo Tarakan (UBT), were selected based on specific criteria to ensure their relevance to the research topic. The criteria included their direct involvement in and experience with the equalization process from Supervisory Positions to Functional Positions. Supervisory Officers were chosen for their firsthand knowledge of the administrative changes, while Personnel Analysts were selected for their expertise in human resources and organizational documentation, essential for understanding the bureaucratic implications of the reform. This selection aimed to capture a diverse range of perspectives crucial to comprehensively exploring the reform's impact within UBT. To ensure representativeness, efforts were made to include participants from different administrative units and levels within the university, thereby reflecting the broader population of administrative staff affected by the reform.

Data collection procedures involve observation, interviews and documentation (Jailani, 2023). Observations were made by systematic observation of the facilities and infrastructure used by respondents in their work. Interviews were conducted with Supervisory Officials who were equalized to Functional Positions and Personnel Analysts, including some key respondents such as Erni Yusnita Sari (Junior Expert Personnel Analyst), Nopiyanti (Junior Expert Archivist), and others. Documentation included data

collection from written archives such as Functional Position Decrees, documents related to Human Resources, and photographs of interviews.

Observation in this research involved systematic scrutiny of facilities, infrastructure, and operational contexts relevant to the roles of Supervisory Officers and Personnel Analysts at UBT. The observation focused on how these resources and environments were utilized in the context of their new Functional Positions. Detailed notes were taken during observation sessions, capturing both physical observations and contextual insights related to daily workflows, organizational dynamics, and challenges encountered in their revised roles. These notes were structured using observation guidelines tailored to the specific research questions, ensuring consistency and depth in data collection. Analysis of observation notes involved identifying patterns, discrepancies, and recurring themes that shed light on the practical implications and adaptations associated with the reform. This approach facilitated a nuanced understanding of how administrative reforms manifest in everyday practices and organizational dynamics at UBT.

Data analysis is carried out before, during, and after data collection in the field. According to Sugiyono (2014), data analysis is the process of compiling data systematically to produce conclusions that are easy to understand. Data analysis techniques include data collection through observation, interviews, and documentation; data reduction by simplifying raw data through selection, focusing, and verification; data presentation in narrative form arranged systematically; and drawing conclusions by comparing data to answer existing problems. This research uses qualitative descriptive analysis to fully and deeply describe the phenomenon under study.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Implementation of Supervisory Position Equalization Policy into Functional Position

3.1 Communication

Communication is a means of conveying information. Good and effective communication is one of the determinants of effectiveness and communication is needed in policy implementation (Crameri et al., 2020; Chi et al., 2020). Communication in this theory consists of 3 dimensions, namely transmission, clarity, and consistency. In terms of transmission, the equalization of positions was conveyed by the University of Borneo Tarakan to respondents not through socialization but by providing information through personal networks that there was equalization of positions. This is in accordance with the statements of the respondents, as follows: "We only get information about equalization of positions from staffing and there is no socialization by gathering ASNs who will be equalized" (Interview results 7 and 15 September 2023)

This is also revealed by the results of an interview with Mr. Abdul Majid as Chair of the Working Group, namely: "There is no socialization of equalization of positions to ASNs who will be equalized, only limited to the delivery of information on equalization of positions through private networks" (Interview result 4 October 2023).

This indicates that the equalization policy has been delivered to the target group directly. From observations and interviews, the Personnel section of Borneo Tarakan University conveys information about the existence of equalization of positions through a private network containing information about the requirements that must be met by Civil Servants. Delivery or transmission is an important first step because transmission requires a good way so that Civil Servants can receive information well and the information can be understood as clearly as possible.

From the explanation of the communication factors above, it can be concluded that communication consisting of 3 dimensions is important and crucial in policy implementation. It can be seen that the delivery of equalization of positions from institutions to respondents is only with information through private networks without

any socialization, which has the impact that some respondents do not understand and understand the purpose and purpose of this equalization. In implementing this policy, the consistency of leadership orders is good and clear, although there are some respondents who feel that leadership orders are not consistent and clear because the orders and tasks from the leadership are different from the duties and functions of the Functional Position they carry out.

3.2 Resources

In terms of resources, which include human resources, budget resources, equipment resources and authority resources, it is also revealed from the data and interview results given by respondents. Human resources are a very important factor in an institution (Anwar & Abdullah, 2021). This factor is one of the supporters of the development and progress of the institution. In addition, human resources are a support for success in policy implementation.

In equalizing this position, it is necessary to pay attention to background and competence. From the results of the respondent's interview and from the table above, it can be seen that there are still equalized Civil Servants who are still not in accordance with their educational background. For example, the Head of the Academic Subdivision whose educational background is a Bachelor of Forestry is equalized to the Archivist Functional Position. In addition, in the field of expertise, such as the Head of the General Subdivision at the Faculty, it is equalized to the APBN Financial Management Analyst.

Expertise is a support that is no less important in equalizing this position. Based on the Regulation of the Minister of State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucratic Reform Number 28 of 2019 concerning Equalization of Administrative Positions into Functional Positions, equalization of Supervisory Positions into Functional Positions is an appointment through adjustment/inpassing and the period of occupying a supervisory position is at least one year

Based on the explanation above, it can be concluded that even though there are differences in educational background with the Functional Position held, this equalization is still carried out because it is through adjustment/inpassing. To overcome the differences between educational backgrounds and Functional Positions, Civil Servants can develop and improve competencies by attending trainings and training, this is in accordance with Mulyana & Abu Huraerah (2019) which states that institutional development requires various supporting facilities and infrastructure to improve the course of these activities, such as the availability of human resources with various trainings and training. Meanwhile, Aripin (2015) states that the main resource in government institutions is the civil apparatus which has a direct and indirect role in implementing policies through various programs and real activities. Competence is a carrying capacity for civil apparatus as one of the important capital for developing the ability and competence of the apparatus, for example through various education and training (diklat), leadership, professional development, and technical guidance. Other efforts in improving operator resources to advanced qualifications (S1, S2, S3) in accordance with the competency needs of each institution.

3.3 Dispositions or attitudes

Disposition in this study is about the attitude of equalized Civil Servants at the University of Borneo Tarakan, especially in the Implementation of the Supervisory Position Equalization Policy into Functional Positions at the University of Borneo Tarakan as the implementer of the policy. From the results of the interview it can be seen that the attitude of civil servants accepts and supports the equalization of this position. This is in accordance with the results of an interview with Mr. Abdul Majid as Chairman of the Working Group, namely: "The leadership policy related to the equalization of this position is followed and supported by all Civil Servants who previously held supervisory positions

to accept and support this equalization into Functional Positions" (Interview result October 4, 2023).

From the explanation above, it can be concluded that the disposition or attitude of the Civil Servants of Borneo Tarakan University accepts and supports the equalization of this position by complying with the leadership policies related to the equalization of this position by following the entire process, starting from collecting files, receiving a Functional Position Decree to inauguration. By accepting and following the process of equalizing Supervisory Position into Functional Position is a process towards a clearer career path and focuses on competence.

3.4 Bureaucratic Structure

The bureaucratic structure consists of bureaucracy, division of authority, relationships between work units (Suzuki & Hur, 2020). These aspects are contained in the Organization and Work Procedures (OTK) of Borneo Tarakan University and are further outlined in the Standard Operational Procedure (SOP). Based on the results of interviews with respondents that Civil Servants who have been appointed to Certain Functional Positions work with the old SOP, namely when they were Supervisory Officers. Furthermore, organizational governance after equalization of positions remains hierarchical as before equalization. This is in accordance with the results of an interview with Mr. Abdul Majid as Chairperson of the Working Group related to Organization and Work Procedures (OTK), namely:

"According to the rules after the position equalization process, the institution must adjust the OTK and until now UBT is in the process of changing the OTK so that until now it has not been stated. In a span of 3 years, we have not revised the OTK because there are many problems that must be resolved. Several times we have proposed changes to the OTK and have compiled an academic paper, but there are several requirements that are obstacles, one of which is Human Resources ".(Interview result October 4, 2023)

From the above information, it can be concluded that after the equalization of positions, there were changes in bureaucracy and organizational governance, namely the elimination of echelon 3 and echelon 4 and the existence of Functional Positions. The elimination of echelons and the existence of Functional Positions has not been stated in the Organization and Work Procedures (OTK) and Standard Operational Procedure (SOP). From the results of interviews and observations in the field, although Functional Positions have not been listed in the OTK and SOP, so that the organization or institution continues to run, Borneo Tarakan University forms a working group coordinated by the Chairperson of the Working Group even though the bureaucracy is still hierarchical which is still the same as before the existence of Functional Positions. Ideally, the equalization of positions is carried out by structuring and changing the OTK first and then proceeding with the equalization of Supervisory Positions into Functional Positions.

Obstacles Faced in the Implementation of Equalization of Supervisory Positions into Functional Positions

a. Communication

In the communication factor, there are obstacles in the Implementation of Equalization of Supervisory Positions into Functional Positions at Borneo University Tarakan, namely in transmission and clarity. The delivery of information regarding equalization of positions to equalized Civil Servants is only by providing information through a private network without any socialization so that Civil Servants do not understand and do not understand the purpose and purpose of equalizing positions. This was expressed by the respondents, namely: "We do not understand and have not fully understood the equalization of Supervisory Position into Functional Position. We only know in general, not specifically" (Interview results September 7 and 15, 2023).

In addition, many apparatus get information about equalizing deeper positions not from the staffing unit of the University of Borneo Tarakan but from the supervising agency. This was expressed by respondents, namely:

"I understand and understand about the equalization of positions by getting more information from the supervising agency, namely the KPPN and the Regional Office, especially the credit score, while the University of Borneo Tarakan does not provide information on this matter" (Interview results September 7 and 15, 2023).

From the information above, it can be concluded that there are obstacles to the communication factor in the implementation of the Supervisory Position Equalization policy into Functional Positions, because not all Civil Servants understand and understand the equalization policy of this position so that it can be seen that information on equalization of positions is not conveyed properly to equalized Civil Servants.

In addition, there are consistency constraints, namely that institutional leaders still provide tasks that are not in accordance with the Functional Position that is carried out. There are respondents who not only carry out the duties and functions of Functional Position but also concurrently and carry out duties and functions as Head of Subdivision or Supervisory Officer.

b. Resources

In the resource factor there are still obstacles that must be faced (Abid et al., 2020). For human resources, there are still educational backgrounds and apparatus expertise that are equalized not in accordance with the Functional Position that is carried out. This is in accordance with the respondent's statement, namely: "My educational background and expertise or competence are not in accordance with the Functional

Position that I hold" (Interview results September 7 and 15, 2023).

From this description it can be concluded that there are still obstacles in the Implementation of Equalization of Supervisory Positions into Functional Positions because there are differences in educational backgrounds and expertise with the Functional Positions carried out. Regarding equipment resources or the availability of facilities, there are still *Civil Servants who are equalized into Functional Positions who have not received adequate facilities in supporting their daily work*, this is in accordance with the respondents' statements, namely: "I get adequate facilities but there are shortcomings, namely the absence of a special room and place for archives, so the archives are placed in an unused place" (Interview results September 7 and 15, 2023).

From the above statement, it can be concluded that the facilities for several Functional Positions are still lacking, this is indicated by the absence of a special archive room which is very important for storing archives properly and safely. In addition, there are no facilities in the form of laptops and printers for the APBN Financial Management Analyst Functional. With the constraints in terms of equipment resources, it can lead to not maximizing Civil Servants in providing services while the apparatus is required to be able to provide good services.

c. Dispositions or attitudes

In the disposition factor related to the attitude of equalized civil servants at the University of Borneo Tarakan, an attitude of acceptance and support in carrying out equalization of positions was found. This was stated by the respondents, namely: "*We support equalization of positions because it can cut bureaucracy and there is a guarantee and certainty of professionalism at work*" (Interview results September 7 and 15, 2023).

From the information above, it can be concluded that there are no obstacles and obstacles in the disposition factor in the implementation of equalizing the Supervisory Position into a Functional Position.

d. Bureaucratic Structure

In the bureaucratic structure, there are obstacles to the Implementation of Equalization of Supervisory Positions into Functional Positions, namely with the equalization of positions, Borneo Tarakan University has not adjusted the Organization and Work Procedures (OTK) and Standard Operational Procedure (SOP) so that Functional Positions are not yet contained in the OTK and SOP. This was expressed by the respondents, namely:

"In carrying out our duties and functions we still use the old SOP, there has been no change" (Interview results September 7 and 15, 2023). In addition, the organization's governance still remains after the equalization of Supervisory Positions into Positions, this is in accordance with the statements of the respondents, namely:

"Organizational governance after the equalization of positions is still hierarchical even though working groups have been introduced" (Interview results 7 and 15 September 2023).

From the statements above, it can be concluded that the implementation of the position equalization policy has experienced obstacles in the Standard Operational Procedure (SOP) and organizational governance, this is due to limited or inadequate human resources at the University of Borneo Tarakan. In addition, after equalizing positions, the working group should consist of functional groups coordinated by the head of the working group, but in reality the bureaucracy is still like before equalization, namely hierarchy.

Other Obstacles Faced in the Implementation of Equalization of Supervisory Position into Functional Position In addition to the indicators above, there are also obstacles that are not related to indicators in the implementation of the equalization policy. This was revealed by Mr. Abdul Majid as the Chairperson of the Working Group, namely: "The inhibiting factors in the implementation of this position equalization are regulations from the Ministry that are not ready and do not support the implementation of equalization. In addition, in terms of Civil Servants who are starting to become Structural Officials so that the process of collecting credit numbers which is a new thing and can be said to be somewhat surprised so that they have to learn from the beginning the regulations regarding this matter" (Interview result October 4, 2023).

From the above statement, it can be concluded that the implementation of position equalization at Borneo University has obstacles, namely related to the collection of credit numbers. This is a new thing for civil servants and the collection of credit numbers has different provisions depending on the parent institution or the assessing institution.

4. CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the research conducted, it can be concluded that the implementation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Regulation Number 28 of 2019 concerning Equalization of Administrative Positions into Functional Positions at Borneo Tarakan University has not been optimal. There are several factors that hinder the smooth implementation of this policy. First, the communication factor, where the delivery of equalization of positions is carried out through personal networks without adequate socialization. Second, resource factors, namely there are Civil Servants whose educational background and expertise are not in accordance with the Functional Position they carry, as well as inadequate facilities. Third, the bureaucratic structure factor, where Borneo Tarakan University has not adjusted the Organization and Work Procedures (OTK) and Standard Operational Procedure (SOP), so that organizational governance after equalization of positions is still hierarchical and not based on work groups. In addition, there are obstacles outside the

variables or indicators in the implementation of position equalization, namely regulations and credit score collection.

The practical implications of this research for the development of public policy in Indonesia, particularly in the context of higher education, point to the need for improvements in the implementation mechanism of bureaucratic reform policies. The research provides insights into the importance of effective communication, provision of adequate resources, and adaptive bureaucratic restructuring in the context of higher education.

Based on the research results and conclusions, the researchers propose several recommendations to overcome obstacles in the implementation of position equalization at UBT. First, convey new regulations through socialization, for example by organizing seminars that present resource persons from the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology or the Personnel Section of the University of Borneo Tarakan. Second, mapping positions that are more detailed and relevant to duties and positions, by compiling the names and levels of structural and functional positions in accordance with the structure of authority, duties, responsibilities, job requirements, interests, and needs. Third, fulfill and add facilities, such as file cabinets to support the performance of the Archivist Functional Position. Fourth, Borneo Tarakan University must immediately propose changes to the Organization and Work Procedures (OTK), Standard Operating Procedures (SOP), and position maps related to Functional Positions that are equalized to the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology. Fifth, make a proposal to the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology to submit a credit score assessment to the University of Borneo Tarakan.

The limitations of this study include sample coverage which is limited to employees at the University of Borneo Tarakan, so the findings may not fully reflect the situation in other institutions. This study is also limited to a qualitative approach, which may require quantitative data to strengthen the findings. Suggestions for future research are to expand the research sample to other public universities in Indonesia to get a more comprehensive picture, as well as using mixed methods to obtain more holistic data on the implementation of bureaucratic reform in higher education.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my deep gratitude to the various parties who have supported and assisted in the completion of this article. First, I would like to thank the Open University, especially the Faculty of Law, Social and Political Sciences, for the facilities and academic support provided during this research. My sincere gratitude goes to my colleagues at the University of Borneo Tarakan, especially the Civil Servants and Personnel Analysts who have been willing to take the time and share their experiences during the interview and observation process. Without their participation and cooperation, this research would not have been completed properly. I would also like to thank the journal editors who have provided valuable feedback and made the necessary revisions to ensure this article meets high academic standards. Finally, thank you to my family and friends who always provided moral support and encouragement during the writing of this article.

REFERENCES

- Abid, A., Manzoor, M. F., Farooq, M. S., Farooq, U., & Hussain, M. (2020). Challenges and Issues of Resource Allocation Techniques in Cloud Computing. *KSII Transactions on Internet & Information Systems*, 14(7).
- Anwar, G., & Abdullah, N. N. (2021). The impact of Human resource management practice on Organizational performance. *International Journal of Engineering, Business and Management (IJEEM)*, 5.
- Aripin, S. (2015). Peran Strategis Sekertaris Daerah Dalam Pembangunan Daerah. *Jurnal Academica*

- Fisip Untad*, 7(2).
- Bangsawan, I. (2020). *Implementasi Peraturan Menteri Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara dan Reformasi Birokrasi Republik Indonesia Nomor 10 Tahun 2019 Tentang Perubahan Atas Peraturan Menteri Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara dan Reformasi Birokrasi Republik Indonesia Nomor 52 tahun 20*.
- Bothhale, E. (2023). Admin Reform in Sub-Saharan Countries. In *Global Encyclopedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance* (pp. 240–246). Springer.
- Chi, N., Zhou, Y., Wei, Y., & Hu, F. (2020). Visible light communication in 6G: Advances, challenges, and prospects. *IEEE Vehicular Technology Magazine*, 15(4), 93–102.
- Crameri, F., Shephard, G. E., & Heron, P. J. (2020). The misuse of colour in science communication. *Nature Communications*, 11(1), 5444.
- Dwyer, J., Tenbenschel, T., Lavoie, J., Martini, A., Brown, C., Devitt, J., Myott, P., Tilton, E., & Boulton, A. (2020). Public administration reform for Aboriginal affairs: An institutionalist analysis. *Australian Journal of Public Administration*, 79(4), 550–566.
- Greve, C., Ejersbo, N., Lægheid, P., & Rykkja, L. H. (2020). Unpacking Nordic administrative reforms: Agile and adaptive governments. *International Journal of Public Administration*, 43(8), 697–710.
- Idris, J. (2021). Indonesia's Public Administration Reform Policy. *Journal of Hunan University Natural Sciences*, 48(3).
- Jailani, M. S. (2023). Teknik Pengumpulan Data Dan Instrumen Penelitian Ilmiah Pendidikan Pada Pendekatan Kualitatif dan Kuantitatif. *IHSAN: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 1(2), 1–9.
- Khuroshvili, B. B. (2023). Civil service system in Georgia and its features following the public administration reform (PAR). *Environment and Society*, 8(8).
- Malik, I., & Wahid, N. (2023). Implementasi Agile Governance pada Reformasi Birokrasi 4.0 di Puslatbang KMP LAN Kota Makassar. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 19(1), 85–119.
- Maulana, A., Indriati, F., & Hidayah, K. (2022). Analysis of Bureaucratic Reform Through Delaying of Government Institutions in Indonesia. *Jurnal Borneo Administrator*, 18(2), 155–170.
- Mulyana, Y., & Abu Huraerah, R. M. (2019). Model Kebijakan Mixed Scanning Dalam Pengembangan Pariwisata Cianjur Selatan. *Dinamika Governance: Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Negara*, ISSN, 89–2303.
- Petrescu, C., & Mihalache, F. (2020). Perceptions towards the Quality of Public Services in Romania. Poor Outcomes of Public Administration Reforms? *Calitatea Vieții*, 31(3), 263–285.
- Rifa'i, A., & Albetris, A. (2022). Implementasi Reformasi Birokrasi. *J-MAS (Jurnal Manajemen Dan Sains)*, 7(2), 610–615.
- Rizqi, F. (2021). Implementasi Cyber Notary Di Indonesia Ditinjau Dalam Upaya Reformasi Birokrasi Era 4.0. *Jurnal Hukum Dan Kenotariatan*, 5(1), 37–51.
- Setiawan, I., Sururama, R., & Nurdin, I. (2022). Implementasi Kebijakan Penyederhanaan Organisasi Di Kementerian Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara dan Reformasi Birokrasi. *Jurnal Terapan Pemerintahan Minangkabau*, 2(1), 12–25.
- Setyasih, E. T. (2023). Reformasi Birokrasi Dan Tantangan Implementasi Good Governance di Indonesia. *Jurnal Kelola: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial*, 6(1), 48–62.
- Shafritz, J. M., Russell, E. W., Borick, C. P., & Hyde, A. C. (2022). *Introducing public administration*. Routledge.
- Sri, M. (2022). *Pengelolaan Kinerja Sebagai Implementasi Peraturan Menteri Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara dan Reformasi Birokrasi Republik Indonesia Nomor 6 Tahun 2022*. Kepegawaian UNP.
- Sugiyono. (2014). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan (Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D)*. Penerbit Alfabeta.
- Suzuki, K., & Hur, H. (2020). Bureaucratic structures and organizational commitment: findings from a comparative study of 20 European countries. *Public Management Review*, 22(6), 877–907.
- SYAPUTRA, R. (2021). *IMPLEMENTASI REFORMASI BIROKRASI PUBLIK DI KANTOR KELURAHAN SIDOMULYO BARAT KOTA PEKANBARU*. Universitas Islam Negeri Sultan Syarif Kasim Riau.
- Widiyastomo, R. P. (2020). Percepatan implementasi reformasi birokrasi di pemerintah kabupaten/kota periode tahun 2020-2024. *Mimbar Administrasi*, 17(2), 84–103.